

APPENDIX EA.1. EMISSION FACTORS FOR COMBUSTION FROM NATURAL GAS, LPG, AND OIL-FIRED RESIDENTIAL WATER HEATERS AND CLOTHES DRYERS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EA-1	OVERVIEW	EA.1-1
EA-2	EMISSIONS FACTORS BY FUEL TYPE	EA.1-2
EA-2.1	All Fuels: Carbon	EA.1-2
EA-2.2	Natural Gas	EA.1-2
EA-2.2.1	Oxides of Nitrogen	EA.1-2
EA-2.2.2	Sulfur Dioxide	EA.1-3
EA-2.3	Fuel Oil #2	EA.1-3
EA-2.3.1	Oxides of Nitrogen	EA.1-3
EA-2.3.2	Sulfur Dioxide	EA.1-3
EA-2.4	LPG	EA.1-4
EA-2.4.1	Oxides of Nitrogen	EA.1-4
EA-2.4.2	Sulfur Dioxide	EA.1-5
EA-3	SUMMARY	EA.1-5

LIST OF TABLES

Table EA-1.1	Estimated National Average Emission Factors for Household Fuel Combustion of Natural Gas, Fuel Oil #2, and LPG	EA.1-2
--------------	---	--------

APPENDIX EA-1. EMISSION FACTORS FOR COMBUSTION FROM NATURAL GAS, LPG, AND OIL-FIRED RESIDENTIAL WATER HEATERS AND CLOTHES DRYERS

EA-1 OVERVIEW

The modified version of the National Energy Modeling System (NEMS) used for the appliance energy efficiency standards analysis, called NEMS-BRS, comprehensively considers a wide range of aspects of energy use.^a However, this model does not consider household emissions of SO₂ and NO_x from the combustion of natural gas, heating fuel oil #2 (i.e., high-sulfur distillate fuel oil), and liquefied petroleum gas (LPG). Because an efficiency standard could result in changes in these emissions, the Department has performed some elementary research to determine appropriate emission factors for carbon, sulfur dioxide (SO₂), and oxides of nitrogen (NO_x) from household appliances. Specifically, this work focuses on emission rates from the use of water heaters and clothes dryers and is used to calculate emissions savings from proposed efficiency standards on clothes washers.

This analysis attempts to verify that the emissions factors from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) for carbon, SO₂, and NO_x from natural gas, fuel oil, and LPG combustion are representative of the U.S.¹ The EPA cautions against the use of these emissions factors as representative of actual emissions. Rather, they are to be used, and are used here, as general approximations of national average emissions factors in order to calculate emissions savings that result from proposed water heater or clothes washer energy-efficiency standards. This analysis compares EPA's emissions factors with those from other sources and with regional regulations.

Table EA-1 summarizes the emissions factor estimates for the three fuels of interest. The values presented here are based on EPA's assessment of combustion emissions (with the exception of SO₂ from LPG, see discussion below). These emissions estimates represent an approximate emissions factor for the U.S. as a whole. They are used, together with estimated energy savings, to calculate end-use site emissions savings. The emissions factors discussed in this analysis are represented as mass, grams (g) or kilograms (kg), of the specific emission of interest per gigajoule (GJ) of energy input to the water heater or clothes washer.^b

There are significant differences in state regulations, making it difficult to generalize about localized emissions. For residential fuel oil combustion, stricter state standards exist in the northeastern United States and southern California than elsewhere. State and local agencies like

^aFor more information on NEMS, please refer to the U.S. Department of Energy, Energy Information Administration documentation. A useful summary is *National Energy Modeling System: An Overview 1998*, DOE/EIA-0581(98), February 1998. DOE/EIA approves use of the name NEMS to describe only an official version of the model without any modification to code or data. Because our analysis entails some minor code modifications and the model is run under policy scenarios that are variations on DOE/EIA assumptions, the name NEMS-BRS refers to the model as used here (BRS is DOE's Building Research and Standards office, under whose aegis this work has been performed).

^b 0.454 kg = 1 pound (lb); 1.055 GJ = 1 million British thermal units (MBtu)

southern California's South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD), the New Jersey Department of Environmental Protection, and the New York Department of Environmental Conservation have established regulations for residential fuel combustion emissions. These regulations, however, are local to individual counties and do not apply to all regions in the Northeast or even all of California.

Table EA-1.1 Estimated National Average Emission Factors for Household Fuel Combustion of Natural Gas, Fuel Oil #2, and LPG

	Carbon (kg/GJ)	SO₂ (g/GJ)	NO_x (g/GJ)
Natural Gas	13.8	0	42
Heating Fuel Oil #2	18.7	218	61
LPG	16	7.2	66

EA-2 EMISSIONS FACTORS BY FUEL TYPE

EA-2.1 All Fuels: Carbon

NEMS-BRS tracks emissions of carbon as CO₂, but factors are included here for completeness. The combustion of natural gas, fuel oil #2, and LPG oxidizes virtually all carbon in the fuel to CO₂. This facilitates estimating carbon emissions factors because the carbon content of the fuel is the only determinant of emissions. The carbon estimates in Table EA-1.1 are based on EPA's assessment of carbon combustion from natural gas, fuel oil #2, and LPG use. Other sources of information include the U.S. DOE's Energy Information Administration (EIA), Oregon State EPA, and the Gas Research Institute (GRI). All agree to within ± 2.0 % of EPA's assessed estimate of carbon emissions. EPA's carbon emissions factors for natural gas, fuel oil #2, and LPG combustion are therefore a reasonable evaluation of nationally averaged carbon emissions rates.

Carbon monoxide (CO) can be formed by incomplete carbon oxidization, causing a severe health hazard. CO emissions only result from poorly functioning appliances, and since NEMS-BRS assumes that all water heaters or clothes washers are functioning properly, it is unlikely that these emissions will change.

EA-2.2 Natural Gas

EA-2.2.1 Oxides of Nitrogen

Emissions of NO_x that result from the combustion of natural gas from appliances are also covered by regulations in some jurisdictions. The EPA's estimated NO_x emissions factor of 42 g/GJ from gas-fired water heaters or clothes washers is equal to the regulation set by the state of New York. This is approximately 20% higher than the strict standard set by the South Coast Air Quality

Management District (SCAQMD). The SCAQMD provides extensive research into emissions factors² and California regulations tend to influence many other states. New Jersey is the only other state that is known to have NO_x emissions regulations for water heaters, with a limit of 86g of NO_x/GJ of heat input. The absence of regulations in other states suggests that most have emissions rates comparable to U.S. EPA's estimated value.

EA-2.2.2 Sulfur Dioxide

SO₂ emissions from natural gas combustion are assumed to be zero.

EA-2.3 Fuel Oil #2

EA-2.3.1 Oxides of Nitrogen

NO_x formation in combustion processes is significantly more complex than SO₂ or CO₂. NO_x can result from oxidization of N₂ in the fuel, but the larger source is N₂ in the combustion intake. This process is sensitive to combustion chemistry, and therefore, quite variable. It also implies that appliance design can lower NO_x emissions. An added difficulty is that the potential hazard of residential NO_x emissions is also hard to quantify. NO_x is both an acid precipitation and ozone (O₃) precursor, but because residential appliances are a relatively small and dispersed (i.e., hard to monitor) source, these emissions tend to play a small role in NO_x control strategies. The O₃ hazards of NO_x emissions are highly variable both spatially and over time, as weather conditions favor or disfavor O₃ formation. One would, therefore, expect NO_x emissions rules to vary significantly across jurisdictions.

The value estimated by EPA of 61 g of NO_x/GJ is for distillate oil-fired boilers with a combustion rate less than 106 GJ/hour (or 100 MBtu/hour) of heat input. This combustion type is characteristic of residential water heaters or clothes washers.³ Additional research into specific state regulations reveals good matches with the U.S. EPA's emissions factor: New Hampshire limits NO_x emissions to 60 g/GJ for non-utility boilers and New York and New Jersey regulations cap emissions at 52 g of NO_x/GJ. These state limits confirm that the U.S. EPA's estimate can serve as a reasonable national average.

EA-2.3.2 Sulfur Dioxide

Emissions of SO₂ are a direct function of the sulfur content of the fuel. Assuming complete combustion of sulfur to SO₂ makes it easy to assess and compare emissions across data sources. Individual state and county regulations limiting the amount of sulfur in residential fuel oil, however, reveal substantial variability in SO₂ emissions factors from the U.S. EPA's estimate of 218g of SO₂/GJ of fuel energy content. This is roughly equivalent to 0.5% sulfur content by weight using an emissions factor for fuel oil #2 of 43,950 g/GJ weight per unit energy content. A straight multiplication of the fuel energy content and the percentage of sulfur content in the fuel provide the emissions factor.

In the state of New York, SO₂ emissions limits range from 88-659 g/GJ depending on the county. In New Hampshire, the emissions rate of SO₂ from high-sulfur distillate fuel oil combustion cannot exceed 176 g/GJ. In Maine and Michigan, the regulations are higher than the U.S. EPA's assessment, limiting SO₂ emissions from fuel oil to 500 g of SO₂/GJ of heat input. Such broad ranges and varying limits in certain regions are a strong argument for using EPA's averaged national value over a regionally weighted average incorporating the various state and county regulations.

Comparing the sulfur content of fuel oil from different refineries also demonstrates regional variability. Most sources were obtained through online web sites detailing product specifications. Mobil Corporation's residential heating fuel oil (#2 high-sulfur) for most states contains a maximum 0.5% sulfur by mass (219 g of SO₂/GJ of heat input), which is very close to EPA's emissions factor. Mobil also markets fuel with lower sulfur content to some regions in the Northeast. For example, Mobil's lowest sulfur content residential heating fuel oil contains 0.2% sulfur by weight (88 g/GJ), as required in New York City, Philadelphia, parts of Delaware, and most of New Jersey. Other regional regulations adhered to by Mobil are 132 g/GJ for most of Pennsylvania and parts of New Jersey, a limit of 127 g of SO₂/GJ of heat input for the state of Illinois, and an SO₂ emissions factor of 145 g/GJ in Massachusetts. The sulfur contents of distillate fuel oil from Chevron, Phillips 66, and the American Society for Testing and Materials (ASTM) exactly match the U.S. EPA's estimate, substantiating the use of the latter for the analysis. Considerable variation does exist among counties and states, especially in the Northeast. Nonetheless, EPA provides a reasonable estimate of emissions from residential oil-fired water heaters that is representative of the national average.

EA-2.4 LPG

EA-2.4.1 Oxides of Nitrogen

Although NES results are presented for LPG, EPA estimates emissions for only propane and butane, fuels within the LPG family of gases. In the United States, the composition of LPG is typically 90% propane (C₃H₈) by liquid volume, 5% propylene (C₃H₆), and 2.5% butane (C₄H₁₀).⁴ This analysis uses the U.S. EPA's propane emissions estimate to verify its comparability with LPG combustion or determines a more suitable estimate from other sources that best represents LPG emissions rates.

EPA estimates an emissions factor of 66 g of NO_x/GJ of energy input from propane-fired water heaters, which is slightly higher than the natural gas estimate. The University of New Hampshire's Energy Office estimates an emissions factor of 43 g/GJ from LPG combustion for the state of New Hampshire. In contrast, the state of New Jersey's EPA establishes an 86 g/GJ emissions factor. Both sources, therefore, support EPA's national assessment of NO_x emissions from residential propane combustion.

EA-2.4.2 Sulfur Dioxide

The sulfur content of LPG is very low⁵ although a few regulations exist in certain parts of the country. The U.S. EPA's SO₂ emissions estimate is derived from the sulfur content of the propane fuel. With 90% of LPG comprised of propane, the EPA's propane emissions factor is a reasonable value for LPG emissions rates. Under the New Hampshire Department of Environmental Services (DES) regulation, the maximum sulfur content allowable is 13.3 g/GJ of SO₂ from LPG combustion. The San Diego County Air Pollution Control District enforces a stricter limit of only 8.8 g of SO₂/GJ of energy input using the U.S. EPA's recommended value. Both the ASTM and Santa Barbara County Air Pollution Control District specify a sulfur standard of 0.0185% sulfur by weight, which approximates an emissions factor of 4.0 g of SO₂/GJ of energy input. This calculation is based on an LPG weight per unit energy of 21,756 g/GJ. Even lower, Nett Technologies Inc. estimates a 0.012% sulfur content by mass LPG average for the United States as well as Canada, which is approximately 2.6 g of SO₂/GJ of heat input.

The wide range of emissions factors for SO₂ makes it difficult to determine a representative estimate for the emissions factor and the very small net effect of any energy-efficiency standard argue against making a significant research effort. The obtained estimates range in magnitude from approximately 4 to 13 g/GJ of energy input. The statistical average or arithmetic mean of these four estimates is 7.2 g/GJ, the value provided in Table EA-1. The averaged emissions factor estimate of 7.2 g/GJ energy input is reasonable to explain three of the five sources presented and suitably accounts for the average among the two extreme estimates. Table EA-1 therefore adequately represents national SO₂ emissions from residential LPG combustion.

EA-3 SUMMARY

This investigation of emissions factors from natural gas-, fuel oil-, and LPG-fired residential water heaters and/or clothes washers indicates that using the values estimated by EPA's AP-42 is a robust and credible basis for analysis with NES output. This analysis indicates that regulations at the state and county level, especially in the northeastern region of the United States, are generally not good estimators of the national average set forth by the EPA AP-42 report. This is especially true for SO₂ emissions factors from fuel oil combustion where individual state and county regulations are highly variable. Thus, although it is worthwhile examining regional legislation to support the national average, this analysis demonstrates the complexity that would be required to establish a weighted regional calculation for each emission. EPA's own lack of data on the sulfur content of LPG made it difficult to derive a nationally representative emissions factor for the country as a whole. External sources were therefore incorporated in the Table EA-1 estimate for SO₂ emissions from LPG combustion.

REFERENCES

1. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, *Compilation of Air Pollutant Emission Factors, AP-42, Fifth Edition, Volume I: Stationary Point and Area Sources*, 1998. October. <<http://www.epa.gov/ttn/chief/ap42.html>>
2. South Coast Air Quality Management District, March, 1995. <<http://www.aqmd.gov/rules/r1121.html>>
3. New Jersey State Department of Environmental Protection, September 1993. <<http://www.state.nj.us/dep/aqm/2719968.htm#Boilers>>
4. United States Hemispheric Clean Cities Program, 1994. <<http://www.hemisccities.doe.gov/altfuels/propane.html>>
5. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, *Compilation of Air Pollutant Emission Factors, AP-42, Fifth Edition, Volume I: Stationary Point and Area Sources, Chapter 1, External Combustion Sources*, 1998. October. <<http://www.epa.gov/ttn/chief/ap42c1.html>>